

ISSN 0179-0846 . ISBN 3-95886-205-0

## **CONCORDIA**

**Internationale Zeitschrift für Philosophie / Revista Internacional de Filosofía /  
Revue Inter-nationale de Philosophie / International Journal of Philosophy**

Herausgeber / Editor / Editeur / Editor: Raúl Fornet-Betancourt

Redaktion / Redacción / Rédaction / Editorial Staff:

Raúl Fornet-Betancourt (verantwortlich), Kanonenwiese 5 a, D - 52070 Aachen

Alfredo Gómez-Muller, 11, rue Crozatier, F - 75012 Paris

Ignacio Delgado, c/ Hornos Caleros 20-3°-A, E - 05001 Avila

© 2018 , Raúl Fornet-Betancourt und

Wissenschaftsverlag Mainz, Süsterfeldstr. 83, 52072 Aachen

Tel. +49/ (0)241/ 87 34 34, Fax +49/ (0)241/ 87 55 77, E-Mail: [info@verlag.mainz.de](mailto:info@verlag.mainz.de)

[www.verlag-mainz.de](http://www.verlag-mainz.de)

**CONCORDIA** erscheint halbjährlich. Das Jahresabonnement kostet in Europa EUR 16,50 zuzüglich Versand- und Portokosten. Die Kündigung eines Abonnements ist unter Einhaltung einer drei-monatigen Frist nur zum Jahresende möglich.

Das Einzelheft kostet in Europa EUR 10,50 zuzüglich Versand- und Portokosten.

Manuskripte, Besprechungsexemplare, Zeitschriften-Austauschexemplare sind an eine der oben genannten Redaktionsadressen zu richten.

Bestellungen und Zahlungen sind an den Verlag zu richten.

**CONCORDIA** se publica semestralmente. El precio de la suscripción anual es para Europa de 16,50 Euros, más costos de envío.

La suscripción puede rescindirse sólo para fin de año y observando un plazo de tres meses.

El número suelto cuesta en Europa 10,50 Euros, más costos de envío.

Manuscritos, libros para reseñas y revistas para intercambio deberán enviarse a una de las direcciones de la redacción.

Pagos en España deberán efectuarse al representante respectivo.

**CONCORDIA** est une publication semestrielle. Le prix de l'abonnement annuel est pour l'Europe de EUR 16,50 (port en sus). L'abonnement peut être résilié seulement en fin d'année et avec un délai de trois mois.

Le prix du numéro isolé pour l'Europe est de EUR 10,50 (port en sus).

Les manuscrites, les livres pour compte rendu et les revues d'échange doivent être envoyés à l'une des adresses de la rédaction.

**CONCORDIA** is published biannually. The annual subscription costs for the Americas, Africa, and Asia: USD 25,00 + forwarding charges. For the termination of the subscription a three-month period to the end of a year must be observed. A single copy costs for the Americas, Africa, and Asia: USD 16,00 + forwarding charges.

Manuscripts, reviewer's copies and journals for exchange please send to the a.m. editorial address. Orders and payments are to be directed to the publisher.

**Inhalt / Indice / Sommaire / Contents  
Aufsätze / Artículos / Articles / Contributions**

<b>1. Einleitung / Introduction / Présentation / Introducción</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>2. Armenia</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2.1 Seyran Zakaryan</b> Essays on Armenian Philosophy at the End of the 20 <sup>th</sup> Century and the Beginning of the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century	
<b>2.2 Silva Petrosyan</b>	<b>19</b>
Eduard Atayan: A Quest for Soul and Freedom	
<b>3. Bulgaria</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>3.1. Tatyana Batuleva</b> La pensée philosophique bulgare: tradition historique et accents contemporains	
<b>3.2. Yvanka B. Raynova</b>	<b>41</b>
Phenomenological Research in Bulgaria: a Historico-Cultural Balance	
<b>4. Romania</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>4.1. Viorel Cernica</b> Problems, Ideas, Concepts and Methods in Romanian Philosophy in the Last Century	
<b>4.2. Madalina Diaconu</b>	<b>71</b>
„Le malheur d’être roumain“. Cioran und die Last der Herkunft	
<b>5. Russia</b>	<b>85</b>
<b>5.1. Aleksandr Zamaleev</b> Die russische Philosophie im post-klassischen Zeitalter	
<b>5.2. Irina V. Tsyk</b>	<b>99</b>
Die Idee des Guten in der Philosophie Wladimir S. Solowjows	
<b>Biographien der AutorInnen</b>	<b>109</b>

**Seyran Zakaryan (Yerevan)**

**ESSAYS ON ARMENIAN PHILOSOPHY AT THE END OF THE 20<sup>TH</sup> CENTURY  
AND THE BEGINNING OF THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY**

*Armenien ist eine der Wiegen der Zivilisation und die Armenier sind eine Nation mit alter Kultur, insbesondere im Bereich der Philosophie. Die armenische Philosophie gehört typologisch zur europäischen Philosophie mit zwei Ursprüngen: Greko-Romanisch und Christlich. Im Mittelalter war das philosophische Denken im Rückzug, und seine Wiederherstellung begann im 17. Jahrhundert. In der zweiten Hälfte des 18. Jahrhunderts begann eine Renaissance der armenischen Philosophie und im 19. Jahrhundert gewann diese zusätzlich an Stärke. Im 20. Jahrhundert erstarkte der Positivismus und verbreitete sich, insbesondere mit dem Marxismus als die offizielle Philosophierichtung von Sowjet-Armenien. Doch die armenische Philosophie wurde in den 40–60 Jahren des 20. Jahrhunderts auf ein neues Niveau gehoben: Nach dem Zusammenbruch der Sowjet-Union und der Unabhängigkeit Armeniens eröffneten sich neue Möglichkeiten zur Entwicklung des armenischen Denkens. Traditionelle philosophische Fragen wurden neu gestellt bzw. neue philosophische Agendas über die Transitionalität und Transformität der Gesellschaft eröffnet. Neu gedacht wurden die Fragen der Wechsel im Wertesystem, die Aktualisierung der nationalen Identität, rechtlich-moralische Fragen des armenischen Genozids, etc.*

Armenia is one of the cradles of civilization, and Armenians are a nation of very old culture, particularly in terms of philosophy. As a matter of typology, Armenian philosophy belongs to European philosophy, as it has two sources: Greco-Roman ancient philosophy and Christian religion, which was adopted as a state religion of Armenia in 301 AD. Armenian philosophy originated in the fifth century, after the creation of the Armenian alphabet in 406 AD., when the Bible and the works of Philo of Alexandria and the Oriental Church Fathers (Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nyssa, Gregory of Nazianzus, etc.), and later, in the eighth century, the works of Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite, were translated into Armenian. Armenian Philhellenic School of translators was active between the fifth and eighth centuries, when works of ancient thinkers, such as Dionysius Thrax, Plato, Aristotle, Zeno, Porphyry, etc. were presented. In the Early Middle Ages three orientations were formed within Armenian philosophy: Christian Apologetics (Mesrop Mashtots, Eznik of Kolb [Koghbatsi]); Armenian Neo-Platonism (David the Invincible) and natural philosophy (Anania of Shirak [Shirakatsi]). During the High Middle Ages (from the fifth to the fourteenth century) scholastic philosophy developed in Armenia (Hovhannes Sarkavag Imastaser – John Deacon Philosopher, Vahram Rabuni, Hovhannes Erznkatsi–John of Erznka). And thanks to Catholic missionaries in the fourteenth century, Armenian philosophy was further enriched by the works of European scholastic

thinkers (Gilbertus Poretanus, Albert the Great, Thomas Aquinas, etc.). Then university philosophy flourished (Hovhan Vorotnetsi, Grigor Tatevatsi – Grigor of Tatev) yet in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries philosophical thought was in decline. Its restoration began only in the seventeenth century. In the second half of the eighteenth century Armenian enlightenment philosophy was originated and it became dominant in the nineteenth century. Then positivism spread; and from the beginning of the twentieth century, Marxism (Stepan Shahumyan, etc.) was the official philosophy of Soviet Armenia (1920-1991). It was ideologized, scholastic, and dogmatic; nevertheless to some extent it promoted a culture of philosophical thinking in Armenia. Armenian philosophers of the time managed to create theories deserving attention, despite (and perhaps because of) not being able to leave the framework of the Marxist philosophy. From the 1940s to the 1960s, the history of Armenian philosophy was upgraded to a new level. The collapse of the Soviet Union, the end of Marxist philosophy's dominance, and the Republic of Armenia declaration of independence in 1991 opened new perspectives for development of Armenian philosophical thought. Traditional philosophical problems were rethought and new issues came to the fore concerning patterns of transitional and transformational societies; changes in value systems; the actualization of the national identity; legal-moral questions of Armenian genocide, etc. Other disciplines were established on the basis of philosophy, including sociology, psychology, political science, culturology. In 2015 Yerevan State University's Faculty of Philosophy celebrated its 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary and once more showed its leading role in philosophical education and in the elaboration of philosophical theories and questions in Armenia. Many prominent philosophers of the period discussed here, such as Hrachya Shaqaryan, Aramays Hovsepyan, Levon Abrahamyan performed research here, working on questions of philosophy of creativity, semiotics, moral and political theories, and the history of philosophy. Naturally, it is impossible to present every theoretical achievement of Armenian philosophers in one article, so I will present the thinkers that are known not only in Armenia, but also abroad.

During the last three decades Armenian philosophers, including Gevorg Abeli Brutyan, Hamlet Ambakumi Gevorgyan, Eduard Rafayeli Atayan, amongst others, undertook work concerning gnoseology, philosophy of science, semiotics, logic, philosophy of culture, etc.

World-renown philosopher, theorist of logic Georg Abeli Brutyan (1926-2015), the founder of the Yerevan school of argumentation, advanced several theories, including a) the framework of polylogic, basic concepts of which are presented

in the journal *Mind*<sup>1</sup>; b) transformational logic, which explores explicit and implicit forms of thoughts and their correlations, revealing the rules of discovering implicit forms (structures) based on corresponding explicit forms (structures). According to his theory by means of transformational logic it turns out to be possible to overcome some known limitations of formal logic as concern the relationship between positive and negative terms; the legitimacy of some types of divisions of terms; the interrelation between explicit forms of propositions and the proposition of existence; the interrelation between negative propositions and propositions with negative predicates; the criterion defining the quantity of propositions; questions for syllogism theory; and so forth. He also presents c) the principle of linguistic complementarity, which allows a set of questions concerning gnoseology and philosophy of language to be rethought anew<sup>2</sup>; and d) the theory of argumentation, which is the reason why the Yerevan school of argumentation was established, and where concepts of argumentation, proof and justification, preconditions of argumentation, theories of logic and rhetoric, persuasion, the role and place of the truth in argumentation, etc. were further elaborated<sup>3</sup>. For example, though representative of the Belgian school of argumentation Chaim Perelman identifies argumentation with rhetoric, calling it "the New Rhetoric." According to Brutyan, if argumentation takes place in the subject domain where there is no need for persuasion, then there is no need for rhetoric as well. But if argumentation deals with cases where there is a need for persuasion, e.g. in the social-political sphere, then the art of rhetoric takes on its most important meaning<sup>4</sup>.

The preconditions of his theory of argumentation are as follows: a) the preservation of the normative grammar, the grammatical rules of the given language maintained by argumentators using the language during argumentation; b) following the rules of logic; c) being led by the truth; d) avoiding impermissible tricks during argumentation. In the context of argumentation, the logical structure and aims of the process of justification are separated; the specifics of the

<sup>1</sup> Georg Abeli Brutian, *On the Conception of Polylogic Mind*, Vol. 77. No. 307, Oxford Univ. Press, Oxford 1968, pp. 351-359.

<sup>2</sup> Georg Abeli Brutian, *The Philosophical Essence of the Theory of Linguistic Relativity: Memorials del XIII congreso internacional de filosofia*, Comunicaciones Libres, Vol 5, Univers. nacional autonoma de Mexico, Mexico 1964, pp. 67-76; *The Main Disputable Questions in the Modern Theories of argumentation: Perspectives of Philosophy in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*. Proceedings of the Second Annual Conference (Athens, November 24-26, 2006), Athens 2007, pp. 1-10.

<sup>3</sup> Georg Abeli Brutian, *Logic, Language and Argumentation in Projection of Philosophical Knowledge*, Foundation Galouste Gulbenkian, Lisbon 1998.

<sup>4</sup> Chaim Perelman, Lucie Olbrechts-Tyteca, *The new Rhetoric. A Treatise on Argumentation*, translated by J. Wealkinson and P. Weaver, Univ. of Notre-Dame Press, Indiana 1969.

S. T. Baranov, et.all, *Metafisika soziokulturnoga bitija v opite ruskoj filosofiji: monografija [Die Metaphysik des soziokulturellen Daseins in der Erfahrung der russischen Philosophie. Monographie]*, Izdatelstvo SevKavGTU [Ed. SevKavGTU], Stavropol 2010, 334 S.

Vladimir N. Bjushinkin, Varvara S. Popova (Hg.), *Neokantianstvo v Rosij: Aleksandr Ivanovich Vvedenskij, Ivan Ivanovich Lapshin (Neokantianismus in Russland: Aleksandr Ivanovich Vvedenskij, Ivan Ivanovich Lapshin)*, ROSSPEN [Russische Politische Enzyklopedie], IOM, Moskva 2013, 359 S.

Vladimir N. Porus (Hg.), *Nikolaj A. Berdjaev*, ROSSPEN [Russische Politische Enzyklopedie], IOM, Moskva 2013, 543 S.

Aleksej N. Parshin, Oxana M. Sedih (Hg.), *Pavel Aleksandrovich Florenskij*, ROSSPEN [Russische Politische Enzyklopedie], IOM, Moskva 2013, 583 p.

Irina I. Blauberg, *Petr Alekseevich Kropotkin*, ROSSPEN [Russische Politische Enzyklopedie], IOM, Moskva 2012, 446 S.

Michail P. Mchedlov, Michail K. Gorshkov, V. V. Gorbunov (Hg.), *Rossijskaja zivilizacija. Ethnokulturnie i duhovnije aspekti. Enziclopedičeskij slovar. [Die russische Zivilisation. Ethnokulturelle und geistige Aspekte. Enzyklopädisches Wörterbuch]*, Respublika, Moskva 2001, 544 S.

Michail A. Maslin (Hg.), *Russkaja filosofija. Enzyklopedia [Die russische Philosophie. Enzyklopädie]*, Algoritm, Moskva 2007, 736 S.

Valerij A. Kuvakin, Michail A. Maslin (Hg.), *Russkaja filosofskaja mysl: na Rusi, v Rosij i za rubežom [Das russische philosophische Denken: der Russen, in Russland und im Ausland]*, Izd. Moskovskogo Universiteta, Moskva 2013, 600 S.

A. V. Buzgalin, B. I. Prujinin (Hg.), *Russkij marxism: Georgij Valentinovič Plehanov, Vladimir Ilich Uljanov (Lenin)*, [Der russische Marxismus: Georgij Valentinovič Plehanov, Vladimir Ilich Uljanov (Lenin)], ROSSPEN [Russische Politische Enzyklopedie], IOM, Moskva 2013, 591 S.

Irina V. Tsvyk, *Duhovno-akademichnaja filosofija v Rossij XIX v. [Geistige und akademische Philosophie in Russland des XIX Jhd.]*, Izdatelstvo BUKH, Moskva 2002, 333 S.

Aleksandr V. Shevzov, *M. I. Karinskij i russkaja gnoseologia konca XIX nachala XX veka [M. I. Karinskij und die russische Gnoseologie des XIX und Anfang des XX Jhd.]*, Mir filosofij, Moskva 2017, 303 S.

### **Authors of Concordia: Contemporary Philosophy from Eastern Europe**

**Seyran Zakaryan (also Zaqaryan)** is a Professor and graduate of Yerevan State University. He earned his PhD at YSU defending the thesis *The Problem of the Universals in the Armenian Philosophy of XIII-XV centuries*. The title of his habilitation thesis is: *The Problem of Man in Armenian Philosophy of 13-15th centuries*, published 1999 in Yerevan. He teaches at YSU since 1987 and has been the Head of the Chair of History of Philosophy YSU since 2001. His academic courses are in Ancient Philosophy, History of Medieval and Renaissance Philosophy, and Armenian Identity. Prof. Zakaryan's professional interests are in the History of Armenian Philosophy and Culture and the Problems of Identity. He is author of ten monographs. His most important publications are: *The Problem of Armenian Renaissance* (2006), *The Problem of the Universals in the Medieval Philosophy* (2014), *Hovhan Vorotnetsi* (2017).  
Email: s.zakaryan@ysu.am

**Aleksandr F. Zamaleev** is Professor at the St. Petersburg State University, Institute of Philosophy. The title of his habilitation thesis is: *Philosophical Thinking in Russia of the Middle Ages in the 11th-16th centuries*. He is head of the Department for History of Russian Philosophy at the University of St. Petersburg. Since 1994 he has been editor of the *Veche – Journal for Russian Philosophy and Culture*. He has published several theoretical textbooks on the history of Russian philosophy, political science, and the history of Russian culture. He is the recipient of the scientific award: "1500 years of Kiev". His most important publications are (short excerpt): *Russian Religious Philosophy 19-20 th centuries*, Ed. SpbGU, St. Petersburg 2007; *Self-awareness of Russia. Philosophical, Political and Cultural Research*, Nauka, St. Petersburg 2010; *Intuition of the Russian mind: Articles, Speeches, Notes*, Ed. Univers. Kniga, St. Petersburg 2011; *Textbook of Russian Political Science*, Ed. Letnij sad, St. Petersburg 2002; *Annals of Russian philosophy*, Ed. Ed. Letnij sad, St. Petersburg 2002 (With: M. V. Ivanova, A.V. Malinov, T. V. Orlova); *History of Russian Philosophy*, Ed. SPbGU, St. Petersburg 2012.  
Email: rusphil@gmail.com

**Irina V. Tsvyk** is Professor of Philosophy at the Moscow Institute of Aviation (Aviationsinstitut, National Research Institute). Her postdoctoral thesis was titled: *Spiritual-Academic Philosophy in Russia in the 20<sup>th</sup> Century: Historical-philosophical Analysis* (2002). Her main scientific interests include: Russian philosophy of religion, spiritual-academic traditions in Russian philosophy and culture, as well as education and development of professional philosophy in Russia. Professor Tsvyk continues to study the history and philosophy of science, computer ethics, and the ethics of engineering, as well as methodological and research activities. Her main publications include: *Spiritual-Academic Philosophy in Russia in the 20<sup>th</sup> Century: Historical-philosophical Analysis*, Ed.